

Exploring the evidence base for culture, tourism and sport

Purpose

To update.

Summary

This paper identifies the different types of evidence available to the LGA and local authorities on culture, tourism and sport activity. The paper explores the proposition that councils are finding it difficult to demonstrate the impact of their activities in culture, tourism and sport and need further support from the LGA.

Recommendations

Members are invited to:

1. note the content in the paper
2. discuss the questions highlighted in italics in the section 'Challenges and Gaps'
3. share observations on:
4. gaps in the paper
 - other areas which would benefit from exploration
 - key partners that we should engage with on this piece of work
 - the 'next steps' identified in the paper

Action

Officers to progress actions in line with Lead Members' steer.

Contact officer: Lauren Lucas
Position: Adviser
Phone no: 020 7664 3323
Email: Lauren.Lucas@local.gov.uk

Background

1. The Culture, Tourism and Sport work plan includes a commitment to review the evidence base available on culture, tourism and sport, and bring a summary paper to the March Board, highlighting areas where there are opportunities for lobbying or campaigning, and where the Board may want to commission research to close gaps.
2. This paper is intended to outline the types of evidence available to the LGA and to local authorities in this area and to explore the proposition (based on anecdotal evidence) that councils are finding it difficult to demonstrate the impact of their activities in culture, tourism and sport, and need further support from the LGA.
3. There are two questions for us to consider as part of this review:
 - 3.1. What do we know about the size and shape of the sector at a national level?
 - 3.2. What do we know about the impact of culture, tourism and sport on a range of social and economic outcomes?

What do we know about our sector?

4. There are a number of sources of information available on the size and scale of local authorities' contribution to culture, tourism and sport, which help us to build a national picture of their role.

Sector size

5. Councils in England run over 3,500 librariesⁱ (Source: Chartered Institute of Library and Information Professionals)
6. They run over 350 museumsⁱⁱ (according to the 2017 Mendoza Review), although the new Mapping Museum's project, led by Birkbeck University will give a more up-to-date figure.
7. According to Sport England's Active Places Power mapping tool, they own:
 - 7.1. 31 per cent of grass pitches;
 - 7.2. 13 per cent of sports halls;
 - 7.3. 33 per cent of swimming pools;
 - 7.4. 8 per cent of golf courses;
 - 7.5. 17.5 per cent of health and fitness facilities;
 - 7.6. 18.4 per cent of artificial grass pitches;ⁱⁱⁱ

8. They own an estimated 27,000 public parks and green spaces^{iv} (Source: 2017 Communities and Local Government Select Committee report)

Funding

9. Councils are the largest investor in culture and leisure activity, spending £2.2bn a year on culture and related activities. This includes over £1bn a year on museums, theatres and libraries and £1bn on sports, leisure and open spaces^v. They also spend £65m on tourism. These figures are publicly available from Ministry of Housing, Communities and Local Government outturn data. Arts Council England has produced a 'data-dashboard' based on this information which makes spend over time by authority more accessible.

Participation

10. In 2014/15, public libraries were visited 225 million times, which was more than visits to Premier League football games, the cinema and the top 10 UK tourist attractions combined. In 2017/18, this increased to 233 million visits.^{vi}
11. We have access to national data on participation in cultural activity based on the Department for Digital, Culture, Media & Sport 'Taking Part' survey. In 2018/19, the following proportions of adults had engaged with cultural activities in the last 12 months:
 - 11.1. Engaged with the arts – 77.4 per cent
 - 11.2. Visited a heritage site – 72.4 per cent
 - 11.3. Visited a museum or gallery – 50.2 per cent
 - 11.4. Visited a library – 33.2 per cent
12. These figures remain broadly unchanged from 2017/18. Participation in the arts has remained steady since the baseline survey in 2005/6, while attendance at heritage sites has increased slightly over this period (from 62.9 to 72.4 per cent).
13. Museum attendance has seen the greatest increase since 2005/6. In 2018/19, 50.2 per cent of adults reported having visited a museum or gallery in the last year, which is similar to 2017/18 but a significant increase from 2005/06 (42.3 per cent).
14. The Active Lives survey from Sport England gives us equivalent data for participation in physical activity.
15. We know that in the 12 months from May 2018 to May 2019, 1,015,700 more people were active compared to when the survey started in 2015. The total number of active people – those doing at least 150 minutes of moderate intensity physical activity per week – went up to 28.6 million.
16. The number of inactive people – doing fewer than 30 minutes of moderate intensity physical activity per week – is down to 11.2 million, a decrease of 131,700 since 2015 and the lowest figure ever recorded by the survey.

17. These figures mean that 63.2 per cent of the adult population are now classed as active, with 24.8 per cent now inactive.^{vii}

What do we know about the impact of culture, tourism and sport on a range of economic and social outcomes?

18. There are too many varied sources of information on the impact of culture, tourism and sport to identify each individually, but some of the key statistics we tend to employ include the following:

Economic impact

19. Government statistics give a good overview of the economic contribution made by culture and the creative industries.

19.1. In 2018 there were 5.3 million jobs in Digital, Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) sectors, accounting for 16.0 per cent of all UK jobs. Across the DCMS sectors, the Creative Industries has the most jobs and has seen the largest increase in the number of jobs since 2011.

19.2. In 2018, all DCMS sectors contributed £224.1bn to the economy, accounting for 11.7 per cent of Gross Value Added (GVA).

19.3. The Digital Sector contributed £149.0bn to the UK economy in 2018, accounting for 7.7 per cent of UK GVA. GVA by this sector has increased by 30.4 per cent in real terms since 2010, with the Telecoms sector contributing £36.6bn, increasing by 35.4 per cent in real terms since 2010.

19.4. The Creative Industries contributed £111.7bn to the UK economy in 2018, an increase of 43.2 per cent in real terms since 2010

19.5. The Cultural Sector contributed £32.3bn to the UK economy in 2018, an increase of 21.9 per cent in real terms since 2010.

19.6. The Sport and Gambling sectors contributed £16.0bn and £8.7bn respectively, increasing by 16.0 per cent and 57.6 per cent respectively, in real terms, since 2010.

19.7. The Civil Society sector (non-market charities) contributed £16.2bn in 2018.^{viii}

20. According to Visit Britain/Visit England, visitors spent £951 million in Britain in the last financial year (2018/19). Spending by overseas visitors is predicted to reach a record £26.6 billion in 2020, a 6.6 per cent increase on the expected spending in 2019 of £25 billion. The number of overseas visits to the UK is forecast to rise this year to 39.7 million, the highest ever, and up 2.9 per cent in 2019. During the last decade inbound tourism visits to the UK have grown 33 per cent and spending by 58 per cent^{ix}

Social impact

21. The social impact of our sector is harder to quantify and it is here that there are the greatest gaps in our knowledge. We know from the October 2019 LGA Satisfaction

Survey that 62 per cent of residents are 'very or fairly' satisfied with their library services and 60 per cent with their sports and leisure services.

22. We also have national participation figures (highlighted above). However, the social impact of this participation is less comprehensively evidenced. This evidence tends to be based around individual studies of particular types of intervention, and evaluations of projects or activities.
23. Rather than produce an exhaustive list of studies demonstrating the impact of culture, tourism and sport, we have given an overview of the types of evidence available to highlight gaps and potential areas of work for the LGA.

What is currently available to the sector?

Nationally collected evidence

24. There are a number of sources of information collected at a national level that deal with culture and sport (see **Appendix A** for a working list).
25. As we have seen, some of these datasets are free and publicly available (Taking Part and Active Lives surveys for example), whereas some are part of a subscription service (e.g. The Chartered Institute of Public Finance and Accountancy and the Association for Public Service Excellence).
26. Typically the majority of this data is based on outputs, such as participation figures, number of physical assets and footfall, which may be used in some cases as a proxy for outcomes, but do not in most cases provide evidence of social impact. The LGA collates data via LG Inform and collects an annual benchmarking survey of resident satisfaction.
27. In some cases these figures can be used at a local level, particularly where there is a subscription model, but in the case of national surveys the sample size is not large enough to support interrogation at a local authority level.
28. In the sports sector, there are a number of data tools, which allow leisure centres and other providers to share their data using common data standards, giving them the opportunity to generate insights into their users and their operating model. Data Hub is a notable example here. Meanwhile projects like Open Active (led by Sport England and Open Data Institute) are trying to produce open source tools that are free to all.

Locally collected evidence

29. Data collected locally on culture and leisure services can vary greatly from one local authority to the next. Some local authorities have adopted a data-driven approach but most do not have the resources to invest in this type of work, particularly at a district level.
30. Information that is typically collected by local authorities includes:
 - 30.1. Visitor figures for local authority services (leisure centres, libraries, arts centres etc)

30.2. Visitor figures for partner organisations or projects in receipt of local authority funding (theatres or arts centres for example).

30.3. Individual project evaluation.

30.4. Economic growth figures relating to the creative industries and tourism – although these are most likely to be held at Combined Authority or Local Enterprise Partnership level.

Academic studies

31. There are a wide range of academic studies relating to cultural value at a UK and international level. In some cases these are independent studies; others are commissioned by public sector bodies and charities for the purposes of evaluation or advocacy.
32. In some policy areas there has been detailed work designed to bring these findings together in one place, for example [Creative Health](#), a report developed by the All Party Parliamentary Group on Arts, Health and Wellbeing, which provides a comprehensive overview of research into the relationship between health and the arts. In other areas it is harder to access this information for the purposes of policy making.
33. There have been broader sector-wide programmes of work designed to link local authorities with their higher education institutions and many councils work closely with local universities to provide local leadership on topics such as local growth and skills, but less often in relation to improving the local authority evidence base.

What work is already underway?

34. Use of evidence is a busy space and to avoid duplicating our work it is important to have an overview of what existing initiatives are already taking place. Some of those most relevant to the use of evidence in culture and sport are identified below.
35. [What Works Centres](#) - The What Works Centres aim to improve the way government and other public sector organisations create, share and use high quality evidence in decision-making. The network is made up of nine independent What Works Centres, three affiliate members and one associate member. Each centre is committed to increasing the supply of and demand for evidence in their policy area, and their output is tailored to the needs of decision-makers. The centres deal with a wide range of policy areas including health and social care, educational attainment, early intervention, local economic growth and wellbeing.
36. [Centre for Cultural Value](#) - Funded by the Arts and Humanities Research Council, Paul Hamlyn Foundation and Arts Council England with an investment of £2 million over five years, the new Centre for Cultural Value at Leeds University has been established to advance understanding of the value of the UK's arts and culture sector. It will focus on the role of arts and culture in areas including conflict resolution, education, health and wellbeing, and community regeneration, bringing together researchers with expertise in these areas with artists, arts and cultural organisations, audiences, participants and local communities. Its work will emphasise bringing together existing evidence, rather than undertaking new research.

37. *Arts Council work on social impact* - Arts Council England is considering their approach to measuring the social impact of engagement in cultural activity and have commissioned a consultancy to produce an evidence review in the first instance to identify weaknesses and gaps in evidence. This review will be completed in May 2020 and will inform a programme of work on social impact.
38. [*Culture, Health and Wellbeing Alliance*](#) - The Culture, Health and Wellbeing Alliance is a sector support organisation funded by Arts Council England. Its remit is to connect people working in health and culture, and to provide support, information and networking opportunities for its membership, the wider sector, and anyone interested in the relationship between the arts, heritage, creativity and health and wellbeing. It works in partnership with organisations across both the cultural and health sectors – as well as education, criminal justice and many other areas. The Alliance's Steering Group is made up of regional champions from each of the nine English regions. Each region has a champion for the museums sector and for the arts sector. It provides the Secretariat for the APPG on Arts, Health and Wellbeing and gathers and promotes evidence relating to the impact of engagement in arts on health and wellbeing.
39. [*Sport England work on data*](#). Sport England have a comprehensive programme of work focused on making better use of data in a sports and physical activity context, including the development of their Local Insight Tool, which allows councils to interrogate information about their local area, and Open Active, an open data project aimed at developing training, tools and datasets that can be used by anyone and give insight into participation in physical activity.
40. [*Data Hub*](#): The DataHub is a repository for sport and leisure data, accessed via a single online portal. It provides an automated way for sport, leisure and physical activity providers to securely bring their data together and align it with consistent sector data standards. It is a collaborative project and CLOA sit on the steering group, but it is coordinated by 4global. It is free to access, but additional insight tools must be purchased via a subscription.
41. [*LG Inform*](#): LG Inform is the LGA's online resource bringing together up-to-date published data on a local area down to ward level.
42. [*The Culture and Sport Evidence Programme*](#) (CASE) – This was a DCMS programme which was last updated in 2013. Its objectives were to: understand how far current research and data can address the questions of value and what drives people to engage in culture and sport; understand what types of data, analysis, research and resources CASE should provide to influence policy; influence policy research by producing useful data resources and tools for others to use; use CASE data to inform indicators and targets in future spending reviews; and become a recognised source of culture and sports policy research.

What work has the LGA/Improvement and Development Agency (IDeA) delivered?

43. [*Culture and Sport Improvement Toolkit*](#)- The Culture and Sport Improvement Toolkit (CSIT) was developed by the IDeA to help the culture, sport, green space and tourism sectors continually improve performance based on self-assessment and external challenge through validation and peer supported improvement.

44. The resources associated with CSIT are still available on the LGA website, but the associated programme of peer support and training has been superseded by the LGA peer challenge programme for libraries and culture and the Leadership Essentials training for culture and sport.
45. [*Guide to developing a local outcomes framework for culture and sport*](#) - This web resource was developed and implemented at the same time as the Culture and Sport Improvement Toolkit and the resources remain available on our website. They provide guidance for councils and their partners in creating a local outcomes framework for culture and sport. This is intended to help authorities to measure and evidence the difference their service makes and its contribution to local priorities. It was targeted at those delivering activities on the ground.

Challenges and gaps

46. **Capacity.** Councils have typically reduced their capacity to deliver insight and evaluation through in-house teams in recent years and culture teams in particular are usually focused strongly on delivery. Larger projects and those with external funding may have some level of evaluation built in, but very often resources are stretched tightly and focused on delivery rather than the monitoring of impact. *How can the LGA best use its own resources, including LG Inform and the Improvement Programme to guide councils to the best sources of information or offer them tools to make the most of their own resources?*
47. **Use of data.** Councils collect a broad range of data across their various services, but often find it difficult to fully use it across services to develop insights about their communities. In the context of culture and leisure, data is regularly collected in relation to attendance at physical assets like leisure centres and libraries, but often less comprehensively when it comes to wider engagement in cultural or creative activities. Local authorities like York and Cambridge City Councils have developed 'culture cards', based on the concept of a library card which allow them to track cultural engagement more successfully, but these are emerging models. *Could the LGA play a role in supporting the sector to adopt consistent models of data-management that could be used at a local, regional or national level as a method of improvement and as material for advocacy?*
48. **Building a wider picture from local data.** In culture and leisure individual projects and services may be evaluated for their impact, but this information is inconsistent, making it difficult to build this information into a broader case for these services. *Is there a case for a framework, or set of replicable evaluation tools that could provide a minimum level of consistency of information?*
49. **Sector gaps.** Based on the analysis in Appendix A, there are more existing tools relating to data and evidence in sport and libraries than in arts and heritage. While there are initiatives aimed at bringing together research relating to arts and culture and impact, there is seemingly no current equivalent in culture for the work on the Data Hub or Open Active in sport. *Is there a role for the LGA in encouraging similar work in relation to culture?*

Next Steps

50. Continue to meet with Arts Council England and remain close to their plans to monitor social impact in culture. When their initial scoping paper is published in May, identify any opportunities to work together following on from their findings.
51. Work with the LGA Research Team to explore opportunities to include more culture, tourism and sport data in the existing datasets on LG Inform, including identifying crossovers between the Arts Council dashboard and LG Inform.
52. Review the existing Culture and Sport Improvement Toolkit and associated frameworks for evaluation on the LGA website to assess their value and usage, with a view to determining whether they should be refreshed.

Appendix A: Types of data available at a national level

	<u>CTS Area</u>	<u>Lead body</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Topics covered</u>	<u>Notes</u>
Taking Part survey	Culture and sport	Department for Digital, Culture, Media and Sport (DCMS) (and Arts Council England, Historic England and Sport England)	A continuous face to face household survey of adults aged 16 and over and children aged 5 to 15 years old in England. It has run since 2005 and is the main evidence source for DCMS and its sectors.	The Taking Part survey collects data on engagement in: arts; museums and galleries; archives; libraries; heritage and sport. It includes information on frequency of participation, reasons for participating, barriers to participation and attitudes to the sectors.	Long running, so good for benchmarking change Regional analysis available, but not by local authority. Measures participation, rather than impact.
Active Lives	Sport	Sport England	Two surveys: Active Lives Adult, which is published twice a year and replaced Sport England's Active People Survey, and Active Lives Children and Young People, which is published annually.	Sport and physical activity. The surveys include questions on levels of activity, types of activity, spectating, volunteering to support sport and physical activity and some outcomes measures.	
Local Insight Tool	Sport	Sport England	Insight tool	The Local Insight tool lets you view and explore Sport	

				England's socio-economic and demographic data by local authority, Active Partnership and regional areas.	
Market Segmentation Tool	Sport	Sport England		The tool provides 19 sporting segments to build understanding of the nation's attitudes to sport, their motivations and barriers. You can use the tool to view data down to postcode level.	
Open Active	Sport	Sport England and Open Data Institute	Open Active work with organisations to open up data about physical activity opportunities for anyone to access, use, and share.	They produce standards, training and tools and publish data - all openly licensed, making them free for anyone to access, use, or share.	Free and openly licensed data
Data Hub	Sport	Collaborative project administered by 4global	The DataHub is a repository for sport and leisure data, accessed via a single online portal. An automated way for sport, leisure and physical activity providers to securely bring their data together and align it with	Leisure services data	Access free – additional modules and insight charged for

			consistent sector data standards		
CIPFA public library and archive statistics	Culture	CIPFA		Library and archive services. Long-running national dataset on output measure relating to libraries and archives (footfall and loan figures for example) based on local government returns	Long running data set used for benchmarking Not universal take up and potential for some figures to be interpreted differently in different areas. Paid for service.
Proposed open data schema for libraries	Culture	DCMS	The DCMS Libraries team are currently working on an open data scheme, to which local authorities would submit information on their local services.	Library services. Questions would relate to topics including footfall, opening hours and number of libraries, according to agreed principles.	
Electronic Property Mapping Service (e-PIMS) assets data	Culture and sport	One Public Estate	e-PIMS is the central database of Central Government Civil Estate properties and land. It is also used to record the estates of the Devolved Administrations and increasingly by other wider public sector bodies.	Cultural and sporting physical assets. Although not mandatory for all local authorities, those joining the One Public Estate programme are required to record all land and property assets owned by partnership authorities (except social housing stock)	

				and public sector partners on e-PIMS. Identifies all property assets owned by local authorities, including those used for culture and sport.	
NBS	Sport	Sport England funded	Opt-in national benchmarking standard for leisure centres		
Quest	Sport	Sport England funded	Leisure provider award scheme		
Chartered Institute for the Management of Sport and Physical Activity	Sport		CIMSPA is the professional development body for the UK's sport and physical activity sector. It identifies best practices and standards that should be adopted by our sector and provides training and development opportunities.		
International Passenger Survey	Tourism	Office for National Statistics	Survey and interviews on visitor number and spend		Limited sample size at very local level. Measures participation, rather than impact.
VisitBritain/ VisitEngland figures			VisitBritain/Visit England is the national tourism agency. It carries out a range of monthly and annual tourism surveys		

Resident satisfaction survey	LGA		The LGA undertakes a regular public poll on resident satisfaction with local council services. This is conducted every four months.		
------------------------------	-----	--	---	--	--

ⁱ For further information please see <https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/public-libraries-in-england-basic-dataset>

ⁱⁱ For further information please see https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/673935/The_Mendoza_Review_an_independent_review_of_museums_in_England.pdf

ⁱⁱⁱ For further information please see <https://www.activeplacespower.com/>

^{iv} For further information please see <https://publications.parliament.uk/pa/cm201617/cmselect/cmcomloc/45/45.pdf>

^v For further information please see [http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Funding%20Arts%20and%20Culture%20in%20a%20time%20of%20Austerity%20\(Adrian%20Harvey\).pdf](http://www.artscouncil.org.uk/sites/default/files/download-file/Funding%20Arts%20and%20Culture%20in%20a%20time%20of%20Austerity%20(Adrian%20Harvey).pdf)

^{vi} For further information please see <https://www.local.gov.uk/parliament/briefings-and-responses/debate-public-libraries-house-commons-11-july-2019>

^{vii} For further information please see <https://www.sportengland.org/news/record-one-million-more-active-people-in-england>

^{viii} For further information please see https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment_data/file/863632/DCMS_Sectors_Economic_Estimates_GVA_2018.pdf

^{ix} For further information please see <https://www.visitbritain.org/visitbritain/visitengland-reports-year-tourism-growth-1>